## Case 3536

## Stegosaurus Marsh, 1877 (Dinosauria, Ornithischia): proposed replacement of the type species with Stegosaurus stenops Marsh, 1887

Peter M. Galton

College of Naturopathic Medicine, University of Bridgeport, Bridgeport, CT, U.S.A. & Peabody Museum of Natural History, Yale University, New Haven, CT, U.S.A. (e-mail: pgalton@bridgeport.edu)

Abstract. The purpose of this application, under Article 81.1 of the Code, is to preserve stability in the taxonomy of stegosaurian dinosaurs by replacing Stegosaurus armatus Marsh, 1877, the unidentifiable type species of the ornithischian dinosaur genus Stegosaurus Marsh, 1877, with the very well represented nominal species Stegosaurus stenops Marsh, 1887, also from the Upper Jurassic Morrison Formation, U.S.A. This genus is the basis for Stegosauria Marsh, 1877, STEGOSAUROIDEA Marsh, 1880, STEGOSAURIDAE Marsh, 1880 and STEGOSAURINAE Marsh, 1880. Maidment et al. (2008) listed seven putative autapomorphic characters for Stegosaurus and five for the species Stegosaurus armatus in its current usage. However, the holotype of S. armatus, which consists of an articulated series of 18 incomplete vertebrae from the proximal half of the tail and a very large but incomplete dermal plate, shows none of these diagnostic characters and so S. armatus must be considered a nomen dubium. However, the holotype of S. stenops Marsh, 1887 shares all 12 autapomorphies with S. armatus in its current usage, being based on an almost complete skeleton (USNM 4934), most of it still in the rock preserving almost natural articulation, which would make S. stenops by far the best available species to replace S. armatus as type species of Stegosaurus Marsh, 1877.

**Keywords.** Nomenclature; taxonomy; Dinosauria; Ornithischia; Stegosauria; Stegosau

1. Marsh (1877, p. 513) established *Stegosaurus armatus* (and the order Stegosauria) based on unfigured material (YPM 1850) from Morrison, Wyoming from what is now known as the Morrison Formation, the source of all stegosaurs collected from the U.S.A. Marsh (1880) also erected the STEGOSAURIDAE. Subsequent workers recognised *Stegosaurus armatus* without reference to the holotype that was redescribed by Carpenter & Galton (2001; see also Galton 2010, fig. 1). YPM 1850 includes several incomplete vertebrae: 2 dorsals, caudal 1 or 2, an anterior caudal vertebra, several blocks containing 16 incomplete articulated vertebrae from the proximal half of the tail, and a very large but incomplete dermal plate.

2. Cope (1878) described, but did not illustrate, material from Garden Park near Cañon City, Colorado, as *Hypsirhophus discursus*. The holotype (AMNH 5731) is a dorsal vertebra and an incomplete anterior caudal neural arch. It was redescribed by Carpenter (1998a), who tentatively considered it to be a valid taxon, as did Carpenter

- et al. (2001), based on characters of the dorsal vertebra. It has also been regarded as a junior synonym of *Stegosaurus armatus* (Galton, 1990; Galton & Upchurch, 2004; Maidment et al., 2008; Maidment, 2010) or as a valid species (Galton 2010).
- 3. Marsh (1879, p. 504) briefly described *Stegosaurus ungulatus* based on two partial skeletons YPM 1853 (which may represent more than one individual, see Carpenter & Galton, 2001) and YPM 1858 from YPM Quarries 12 and 11, respectively, at Como Bluff near Como station, Wyoming. Bones of the syntypes were figured by Marsh (1880, 1881a, 1891, 1896), Lull (1910), Gilmore (1914), Ostrom & McIntosh (1966, 1999), Carpenter & Galton (2001) and Galton (2001, 2010). *S. ungulatus* is currently regarded as a junior synonym of *S. armatus* (Galton, 1990; Galton & Upchurch, 2004; Maidment et al., 2008) or as a valid species (Galton & Carpenter, 2001; Galton 2001, 2010, figs. 2b, 3a–e, k–o, r).
- 4. Marsh (1881b, p. 421) established *Diracodon laticeps* based on the characters of teeth in a pair of maxillae from YPM Quarry 13, Como Bluff. Gilmore (1914) considered a distal tail with spikes (USNM 4288) and three carpal bones in manus referred to *Diracodon laticeps* by Marsh (1887, p. 416, pl. 9), and probably also the holotype maxillae, to represent juvenile individuals of *Stegosaurus stenops* Marsh, 1887 (Gilmore, 1914, pp. 104, 108–109). The two incomplete holotype tooth-bearing bones, YPM 1885, were first illustrated as dentaries by Carpenter & Galton (2001). *Diracodon laticeps* Marsh, 1881b is regarded as a nomen dubium (Carpenter & Galton, 2001) or, incorrectly, as a valid taxon (Bakker, 1986, pp. 188, 227) or a junior synonym of either *Stegosaurus stenops* Marsh, 1887 (Galton, 1990, 2010; Galton & Upchurch, 2004) or *S. armatus* Marsh, 1877 (Maidment et al., 2008).
- 5. In 1887 Marsh figured a complete skull (USNM 4934) from Garden Park as Stegosaurus stenops. The rest of the skeleton, which is still in more or less natural articulation as found with 17 plates in position (see Gilmore, 1914; Czerkas, 1987) is complete except for a few distal caudal vertebrae and the anterior pair of tail spikes. The bones were described by Gilmore (1914) and illustrated by Marsh (1891, 1896) and Ostrom & McIntosh (1966, 1999). The skull was also described by Huene (1914) and reconstructed in several views by Galton (1990), Sereno & Dong (1992) and Galton & Upchurch (2004). Reconstructions of the skeleton, with the last part of the tail and the anterior pair of tail spikes based on USNM 4714 from YPM Quarry 13, Como Bluff (Gilmore 1914) were given by Czerkas (1987) and by Paul (1992), Galton (1997, 2010) and Carpenter (2010) who also used data from a second articulated, almost complete referred skeleton from Garden Park (DMNH 2818, see Carpenter, 1998b, fig. 2 as found in quarry, 2007, fig. 2 for other side; found stratigraphically within 10 m of the holotype). S. stenops is regarded either as a valid species (Galton, 1990, 2010; Galton & Upchurch, 2004; Carpenter et al., 2001; Carpenter, 2010) or as a junior synonym of S. armatus (Maidment et al., 2008; Maidment, 2010).
- 6. Stegosaurus duplex Marsh, 1887 (p. 416) is based on a partial skeleton lacking dermal armor (YPM 1858) from YPM Quarry 12 at Como Bluff, which was described and/or illustrated by Marsh (1881a, 1891, 1896), Lull (1910), Ostrom & McIntosh (1966, 1999) and Carpenter & Galton (2001). S. duplex has been regarded as a junior objective synonym of S. ungulatus Marsh, 1879 (Lull, 1910; Gilmore, 1914; Carpenter & Galton, 2001; Galton, 2001, 2010; Maidment et al., 2008, p. 382), which in turn is either a valid species or a junior synonym of S. armatus (see section 3).

- 7. Marsh (1887) illustrated a tail spike, USNM 4937 from YPM Quarry 13 at Como Bluff, as *Stegosaurus sulcatus*. Gilmore (1914) figured this tail spike in articulation with its antimere that lacks sulci. Bakker (1988) showed that the curvature of the very wide spike bases was too shallow to fit over the distal part of the tail. This species is regarded as valid (Galton, 2010, figs. 3g, q), as a junior synonym of *S. armatus* (Galton, 1990; Galton & Upchurch, 2004), or as a nomen dubium (Maidment et al., 2008).
- 8. Gilmore (1914) described and diagnosed the species of *Stegosaurus* based on the USNM holotypes of *S. stenops* and *S. sulcatus*, and reproduced line drawings of *S. ungulatus* from Marsh (1896). He erected *S. longispinus* for a partial skeleton, UW D54 (now UW 20503) from Alcova, Natrona County, Wyoming. This species is considered to be a nomen dubium (Maidment et al., 2008) or valid (Galton, 1990, 2010; Carpenter et al., 2001; Galton & Upchurch, 2004); it is diagnosed by very distinctive distal caudal vertebrae and two pairs of very elongate tail spikes with sub-equal bases (Galton, 2010, figs. 3h–j, u, v).
- 9. Ostrom & McIntosh (1966, reprinted 1999) provided copies of the unpublished lithographic plates of *Stegosaurus* prepared under the supervision of O.C. Marsh in the 1880s. They labelled specimens as *S. armatus* (referred braincase USNM 4936 from Garden Park; braincase and associated postcrania described by Galton (2001) as *S. stenops*), *S. ungulatus* (with *S. duplex* as a junior synonym), *S. stenops* and *S. sulcatus*.
- 10. Galton (1990; also Galton & Upchurch, 2004) noted that the holotype of *Stegosaurus armatus* needed further preparation but considered that *S. ungulatus* was probably a junior synonym, along with *Hypsirhopus discursus*, *Stegosaurus sulcatus* and *S. duplex. S. stenops* and *S. longispinus* were regarded as separate valid species.
- 11. Carpenter et al. (2001) described *Hesperosaurus mjosi* based on a partial skeleton (HMNH 001, cast DMNH 29431) from low in the Morrison Formation in Johnson County, Wyoming. The holotype consists of a nearly complete, disarticulated skull, a complete vertebral column, a partial left scapula and coracoid, ilia, ischia, pubes, 11 dermal plates and four tail spikes. Carpenter et al. (2001) recognised *Stegosaurus armatus, S. ungulatus, S. stenops, S. longispinus* and *Hypsirophus discursus* as valid species. They also pointed out that the three genera of Morrison stegosaurs have a restricted distribution within the Dinosaur Zones of Turner & Peterson (1999), with *Hesperosaurus* limited to Zone 1, *Stegosaurus* to Zones 2 and 3, and *Hypsirophus* to Zone 4.
- 12. Based on a cladistic analysis of the species of Stegosauria they considered to be valid, Maidment et al. (2008) gave seven autapomorphies for the genus *Stegosaurus* sensu Maidment et al. (2008) and five for the species *armatus*, with *Hypsirophus discursus*, *Stegosaurus ungulatus* (with *S. duplex* as a subjective junior synonym), *Diracodon laticeps*, and *Stegosaurus stenops* as junior synonyms of *S. armatus*, and *S. sulcatus* and *S. longispinus* as nomina dubia. *Hesperosaurus mjosi* and *Wuerhosaurus homheni* Dong, 1973 (Lower Cretaceous, China, see Dong, 1990) were referred to *Stegosaurus* as *S. mjosi* (Carpenter et al., 2001) and *S. homheni* (Dong, 1973) and also by Maidment (2010).
- 13. Mossbrucker et al. (2009) noted that further preparation of the blocks of YPM 1850 showed that two fit together (indicated by \*, Galton 2010, fig. 1b) to give taller than predicted neural spines for mid-caudal centra, a possibly diagnostic character for *Stegosaurus armatus* as defined by the holotype.

- 14. Carpenter (2010) provided a revised diagnosis of *Hesperosaurus mjosi* (with contrasting character states for *Stegosaurus stenops*) that included characters from two referred skeletons from low in the Morrison Formation near Howe Ranch, Wyoming (see Siber & Möckli, 2009). He considered that there are too many differences between the skeletons of *H. mjosi* and *Stegosaurus stenops* to support referral to the same genus (see skeletal reconstructions in Carpenter, 2010, figs. 7a, b).
- 15. Maidment (2010) presented a historical survey of the stegosaurian species described from the Morrison formation and repeated the systematic conclusions of Maidment et al. (2008), i.e. recognising *Stegosaurus armatus* (with *Hypsirophus discursus, Stegosaurus ungulatus, Diracodon laticeps* and *Stegosaurus stenops* as junior synonyms) and *S. mjosi* as valid taxa [also *S. homheni* (Dong, 1973)].
- 16. Galton (2010) noted that the holotype of Stegosaurus armatus displayed none of the five putative autapomorphic characters listed by Maidment et al. (2008) for the species armatus in its current usage and only one of the seven autapomorphic characters for the genus Stegosaurus, i.e. the transverse process on the anterior caudal vertebrae (except C1 and C2) projects ventrally rather than laterally. But the holotype of Hesperosaurus mjosi also has this feature, hence YPM 1850 actually displays no autapomorphic characters of S. armatus in its current usage and so S. armatus as defined by the holotype should therefore be considered a nomen dubium. Hypsirophus discursus Cope, 1878 and Diracodon affinis Marsh, 1881a, each with one of the autapomorphic characters of the species armatus in its current usage, are available as possible replacement type species for Stegosaurus Marsh, 1877. As noted in previous sections, most of the other species of Stegosaurus available as a replacement type species are based on incomplete, disarticulated partial skeletons with no skull or field records, i.e. S. ungulatus (has braincase but at least two individuals involved), S. duplex, S. sulcatus and S. longispinus (details in Galton, 2010). In marked contrast, the holotype skeleton (USNM 4934) of S. stenops is almost complete, with a skull. It is mostly preserved in the rock as found, and there is another comparable complete articulated skeleton from the type locality. Stegosaurus stenops Marsh, 1887 displays all 12 autapomorphies determined for the currently accepted concept of S. armatus Marsh, 1877 by Maidment et al. (2008), and is) the only species showing the following two: alternating rows of dermal plates down the midline for Stegosaurus (also in DMNH 2818), and nuchal dermal ossicles for S. armatus (also in DMNH 2818). Consequently, Galton (2010) indicated the need to petition the Commission to designate Stegosaurus stenops Marsh, 1887 as the new type species of Stegosaurus Marsh, 1877 to replace S. armatus Marsh, 1877. This action would preserve stability by conserving Stegosaurus Marsh, 1877, Stegosauria Marsh, 1877, STEGOSAURIDAE Marsh, 1880, STEGOSAUROIDEA Marsh, 1880 and STEGO-SAURINAE Marsh, 1880.
- 17. Should the more elongate mid-caudal neural spines of YPM 1850 prove to be a diagnostic character, as suggested by Mossbrucker et al. (2009), then this would be diagnostic for the species *armatus* as defined by the holotype and YPM 1850 would still lack any of the seven autapomorphies of the genus *Stegosaurus* in its current usage (Maidment et al., 2008).
- 18. The possibility of designating the holotype of *Stegosaurus stenops*, USNM 4934, as a neotype for *S. armatus* Marsh, 1879 in place of the latter's extant holotype YPM 1850, thereby making the two names objective synonyms, has been considered.

However, it was rejected on the basis that the synonymy of the two species cannot be proven and, because of the possible presence of a diagnostic character in the holotype that could differentiate the species armatus from other species in the group, this could possibly necessitate the erection of a new species for YPM 1850. The interests of stability at the generic level are not served by having armatus as the type species of Stegosaurus, because the incomplete and fragmentary holotype of this species lacks the characters of the widely used concept of that genus. In the absence of a Commission's ruling, a new genus could be erected based on S. stenops, thereby restricting Stegosaurus to S. armatus, and giving a new name to the generally accepted concept of the genus Stegosaurus. Consequently, conserving the name of the universally known genus Stegosaurus in its current usage is considered urgent and important.

- 19. The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:
  - (1) to use its plenary power to set aside all previous fixations of type species for the nominal genus *Stegosaurus* Marsh, 1877 and to designate *Stegosaurus stenops* Marsh, 1887 as the type species;
  - (2) to place on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology the name *Stegosaurus* Marsh, 1877 (gender: masculine), type species *Stegosaurus stenops* Marsh, 1887, as ruled in (1) above;
  - (3) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the name *stenops* Marsh, 1887, as published in the binomen *Stegosaurus stenops* (specific name of the type species of *Stegosaurus* Marsh, 1877, as ruled in (1) above).

Institutional abbreviations: AMNH, American Museum of Natural History, New York, U.S.A.; DMNH, Denver Museum of Nature and Science (formerly Denver Museum of Natural History), Colorado, U.S.A.; HMNH, Hayashibara Museum of Natural History, Okayama, Japan; USNM, National Museum of Natural History (formerly United States National Museum), Washington, D.C., U.S.A.; UW, Department of Geology and Geophysics, University of Wyoming, Laramie, U.S.A; and YPM, Peabody Museum of Natural History, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut, U.S.A.

## References

Abel, O. 1919. Die Stamme der Wirbeltiere. 914 pp. De Gruyter, Berlin & Leipzig.

Bakker, R.T. 1986. The dinosaur heresies: new theories unlocking the mystery of the dinosaurs and their extinction. 482 pp. William Morrow, New York.

**Bakker, R.T.** 1988. Review of the Late Cretaceous nodosauroid Dinosauria *Denversaurus schlessmani*, a new armor-plated dinosaur from the latest survivor of the nodosaurians, with comments on stegosaur-nodosaur relationships. *Hunteria*, 1: 1–23.

Carpenter, K. 1998a. Armor of *Stegosaurus stenops*, and the taphonomic history of a new specimen from Garden Park, Colorado. *Modern Geology*, 23: 127–144.

Carpenter, K. 1998b. Vertebrate biostratigraphy of the Morrison Formation near Cañon City, Colorado. *Modern Geology*, **23**: 407–426.

Carpenter, K. 2007. How to make a fossil: Part 1 – Fossilizing bone. *Journal of Paleontological Sciences*, 1: 1–10.

Carpenter, K. 2010. Species concepts in North American stegosaurs. Swiss Journal of Geosciences, 103: 155–162.

Carpenter, K. & Galton, P.M. 2001. Othniel Charles Marsh and the myth of the eight-spiked *Stegosaurus*. Pp. 76–102 *in* Carpenter, K. (Ed.), *The armored dinosaurs*. Indiana University Press, Bloomington.

Carpenter, K., Miles, C.A. & Cloward, K. 2001. New primitive stegosaur from the Morrison Formation, Wyoming. Pp. 55–75 in Carpenter, K. (Ed.), *The armored dinosaurs*. Indiana

University Press, Bloomington.

Cope, E.D. 1878. A new genus of Dinosauria from Colorado. American Naturalist, 12: 181.

Czerkas, S.A. 1987. A reevaluation of the plate arrangement on *Stegosaurus stenops*. Pp. 83–99 in Czerkas, S.J. & Olson, E.C. (Eds.), *Dinosaurs past and present, Volume 2*. University of Washington Press, Seattle.

Dong, Z.-M. 1973. Dinosaurs from Wuerho. Institute of Vertebrate Paleontology and

Paleoanthropology, Memoirs, 11: 45–52.

**Dong, Z.-M.** 1990. Stegosaurs of Asia. Pp. 255–268 in Carpenter, K. & Currie, P.J. (Eds.), *Dinosaur systematics. Approaches and perspectives.* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Galton, P.M. 1990. Stegosauria. Pp. 435–455 in Weishampel, D.B., Dodson, P. & Osmólska, H. (Eds.), *The Dinosauria*, 1st Edition. University of California Press, Berkeley.

Galton, P.M. 1997. Stegosaurs. Pp. 291–306 in Farlow, J.A. & Brett-Surman, M.K. (Eds.), The

complete dinosaur. Indiana University Press, Bloomington.

**Galton, P. M**. 2001. Endocranial casts of the plated dinosaur *Stegosaurus* (Upper Jurassic, western USA): A complete undistorted cast and the original specimens of Othniel Charles Marsh. Pp. 455–484 *in* Carpenter, K. (Ed.), *The armored dinosaurs*. Indiana University Press, Bloomington.

Galton, P.M. 2010. Species of plated dinosaur Stegosaurus (Morrison Formation, Upper Jurassic) of western USA: new type species designation needed. Swiss Journal of

Geosciences, 103: 187–198.

Galton, P.M. & Upchurch, P. 2004. Stegosauria. Pp. 343–362 in Weishampel, D.B., Dodson, P. & Osmólska, H. (Eds.), *The Dinosauria, 2nd edition*. University of California Press, Berkeley.

**Gilmore**, C.W. 1914. Osteology of the armoured Dinosauria in the United States National Museum, with special reference to the genus *Stegosaurus*. *United States National Museum*, *Bulletin*, **89**: i–xi, 1–143, pls. 1–36.

Hay, O.P. 1902. Bibliography and catalogue of the fossil Vertebrata of North America. *United States Geological Survey, Bulletin*, 179: 1–495.

Huene, F. v. 1914. Über die Zweistämmigkeit der Dinosaurier, mit Beiträgen zur Kenntnis einiger Schädel. Neues Jahrbuch für Mineralogie, Geologie und Paläontologie, Beilageband, 37: 577–589.

Lull, R.S. 1910. Stegosaurus ungulatus Marsh, recently mounted at the Peabody Museum of Yale University. American Journal of Science, (4)30: 361–377.

Maidment, S.C.R. 2010. Stegosauria: a historical review of the body fossil record and phylogenetic relationships. Swiss Journal of Geosciences, 103: 199–210.

Maidment, S.C.R., Norman, D.B., Barrett, P.M. & Upchurch, P. 2008. Systematics and phylogeny of Stegosauria (Dinosauria: Ornithischia). *Journal of Systematic Palaeontology*, **6**: 367–407.

Marsh, O.C. 1877. A new order of extinct Reptilia (Stegosauria) from the Jurassic of the Rocky Mountains. *American Journal of Science*, (3)14: 34–35.

Marsh, O.C. 1879. Notice of new Jurassic reptiles. *American Journal of Science*, (3)18: 501–505. Marsh, O.C. 1880. Principal characters of American Jurassic dinosaurs. Part III. *American* 

Journal of Science, (3)19: 253–259.

Marsh, O.C. 1881a. Principal characters of American Jurassic dinosaurs. Part IV: Spinal cord, pelvis, and limbs of *Stegosaurus*. *American Journal of Science*, (3)**21**: 167–170.

Marsh, O.C. 1881b. Principal characters of American Jurassic dinosaurs. Part V. American Journal of Science, (3)21: 417–423.

Marsh, O.C. 1882. Classification of the Dinosauria. *American Journal of Science*, (3)**23**: 81–86. **Marsh, O.C.** 1887. Principal characters of American Jurassic dinosaurs. Part IX: The skull and dermal armor of *Stegosaurus*. *American Journal of Science*, (3)**34**: 413–417.

- Marsh, O.C. 1891. Restoration of *Stegosaurus*. American Journal of Science, (3)42: 179–181. Marsh, O. C. 1896. The dinosaurs of North America. *United States Geological Survey, Annual Report*, 16(1894–95): 133–244.
- Mossbrucker, M. T., Bakker, R. T. & Prueher, L. 2009. New information regarding the holotype of Stegosaurus armatus (Marsh, 1877). Symposium on Stegosauria. June 8 and 9. Scientific Meeting at Sauriermuseum Aathal, Switzerland, Abstracts: 9.
- Ostrom, J.A. & McIntosh, J.S. 1966. Marsh's dinosaurs. The collections from Como Bluff. xiv, 388 pp. Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Ostrom, J.A. & McIntosh, J.S. 1999. Marsh's dinosaurs. The collections from Como Bluff. With a new forward by Peter Dodson and a historical update by Clifford A. Miles and David W. Hamblin. xxiv, 388 pp. Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Paul, G. 1992. The arrangement of the plates in the first complete *Stegosaurus*, from Garden Park. *Tracks in Time, Garden Park Paleontological Society*, 3(1): 1–2.
- Sereno, P.C. & Dong, Z.-M. 1992. The skull of the basal stegosaur *Huayangosaurus taibaii* and a cladistic diagnosis of Stegosauria. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology*, **12**: 318–343.
- Siber, H.J. & Möckli, U. 2009. The stegosaurs of the Sauriermuseum Aathal. 56 pp. Sauriermuseum, Aathal.
- Turner, C.E. & Peterson, F. 1999. Biostratigraphy of dinosaurs in the Upper Jurassic Morrison Formation of the Western Interior, U.S.A. *In Gillette*, D. (Ed.), *Vertebrate Paleontology in Utah. Utah Geological Survey Miscellaneous Publication*, 99–1: 77–114.

Acknowledgement of receipt of this application was published in BZN 67: 270.

Comments on this case are invited for publication (subject to editing) in the *Bulletin*; they should be sent to the Executive Secretary, I.C.Z.N., c/o Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, U.K. (e-mail: iczn@nhm.ac.uk).